

REFER

**U.S. District Court  
Eastern District of Kentucky (Ashland)  
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 0:10-cv-00059-DLB-EBA**

United States v. State Farm Fire And Casualty Company et al

Assigned to: Judge David L. Bunning

Referred to: Magistrate Judge Edward B Atkins

Case in other court: USDC of Mississippi Souther District,  
1:06cv00433WJG-JMR

Cause: 28:1331 Fed. Question

Date Filed: 06/18/2010

Jury Demand: None

Nature of Suit: 890 Other Statutory  
Actions

Jurisdiction: U.S. Government Plaintiff

**In Re**

**The Scruggs Law Firm, P.A./SLF,  
Inc.**

represented by **Cal Mayo**

Mayo Mallette PLLC  
2094 Old Taylor Road  
5 University Office Park  
P.O. Box 1456  
Oxford, MS 38655  
662-236-0055

Fax: 662-236-0035

*LEAD ATTORNEY*

*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Pope S. Mallette**

Mayo Mallette PLLC  
2094 Old Taylor Road  
5 University Office Park  
P.O. Box 1456  
Oxford, MS 38655  
662-236-0055

Fax: 662-236-0035

*LEAD ATTORNEY*

*PRO HAC VICE*

*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Carl D. Edwards , Jr.**

VanAntwerp, Monge, Jones & Edwards

1544 Winchester Avenue  
Suite 500  
P.O. Box 1111  
Ashland, KY 41105-1111  
606-329-2929

Fax: 606-329-0490

Email: cedwards@vmje.com

*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Plaintiff****United States***ex rel*

-

Cori Rigsby

-

Kerri Rigsby

represented by **Alfred B. Jernigan , Jr.**

U.S. Attorney's Office - Jackson MS

188 E. Capitol Street

Suite 500

Jackson, MS 39201

601-965-4480

*LEAD ATTORNEY**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED***August J. Matteis**

Gilbert LLP

11 New York Avenue NW

Suite 700

Washington, DC 20005

202-772-2264

Fax: 202-772-2266

*LEAD ATTORNEY**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED***Benjamin R. Davidson**

Gilbert LLP

11 New York Avenue NW

Suite 700

Washington, DC 20005

202-772-2264

Fax: 202-772-2266

*LEAD ATTORNEY**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED***C. Maison Heidelberg**

Heidelberg Harmon, PLLC

795 Woodlands Parkway

Suite 220

Ridgeland, MS 39157

601-351-3333

Fax: 601-956-2090

*LEAD ATTORNEY**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED***Craig J. Litherland**

Gilbert LLP

11 New York Avenue NW

Suite 700

Washington, DC 20005

202-772-2264

Fax: 202-772-2266

*LEAD ATTORNEY**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Felicia C. Adams**

U.S. Attorney's Office - Jackson MS  
188 E. Capitol Street  
Suite 500  
Jackson, MS 39201  
601-965-4480

*LEAD ATTORNEY*

*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Jay D. Majors**

unknown

*LEAD ATTORNEY*

*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Jeffrey S. Bucholtz**

U.S. Department of Justice - 261  
Ben Franklin Station  
P.O. Box 261  
Washington, DC 20044

*LEAD ATTORNEY*

*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Joyce R. Branda**

U.S. Department of Justice - Civil  
Division  
Ben Franklin Station  
P.O. Box 261  
Washington, DC 20044  
202-514-6846

Fax: 202-305-4117

*LEAD ATTORNEY*

*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Patricia R. Davis**

Department of Justice  
Civil Division  
Ben Franklin Station  
P.O. Box 261  
Washington, DC 20044  
202-514-2000

Fax: 202-305-7797

*LEAD ATTORNEY*

*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Scott D. Gilbert**

Gilbert LLP  
11 New York Avenue NW  
Suite 700  
Washington, DC 20005  
202-772-2264

Fax: 202-772-2266  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Stan Harris**  
U.S. Attorney's Office - Jackson MS  
188 E. Capitol Street  
Suite 500  
Jackson, MS 39201  
601-965-4480  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Virginia R. Kennedy**  
Heidelberg Harmon, PLLC  
795 Woodlands Parkway  
Suite 220  
Ridgeland, MS 39157  
601-351-3333  
Fax: 601-956-2090  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

V.

**Defendant**

**State Farm Fire and Casualty  
Company**

represented by **Edward H. Stopher**  
Boehl, Stopher & Graves - Louisville  
KY  
400 W. Market Street  
2300 Aegon Center  
Louisville, KY 40202-3345  
502-589-5980  
Fax: 502-561-9400  
Email: estopher@bsg-law.com  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Jared A. Cox**  
Boehl, Stopher & Graves - Louisville  
KY  
400 W. Market Street  
2300 Aegon Center  
Louisville, KY 40202-3345  
502-589-5980  
Fax: 502-561-9400  
Email: jcox@bsg-law.com  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Benjamin M. Watson**

Butler Snow O'Mara Stevens &  
Cannada PLLC - Ridgeland  
1020 Highland Colony Parkway  
Suite 1400

Ridgeland, MS 39157

601-948-5711

*PRO HAC VICE*

*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Defendant**

**Forensic Analysis Engineering  
Corporation**

represented by **Daniel D. Wallace**

Gholson Burson Entrekin Orr PA  
535 N. Fifth Avenue

P.O. Box 1289

Laurel, MS 39441-1289

601-649-4440

Fax: 601-649-4441

*LEAD ATTORNEY*

*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Robert D. Gholson**

Gholson Burson Entrekin Orr PA  
535 N. Fifth Avenue

P.O. Box 1289

Laurel, MS 39441-1289

601-649-4440

Fax: 601-649-4441

*LEAD ATTORNEY*

*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Defendant**

**Haag Engineering Company**

represented by **Kathryn Breard Platt**

Gallaway Johnson Tompkins Burr &  
Smith

2510 14th Street

Suite 910

Gulfport, MS 39501

228-214-4250

Fax: 228-214-9650

*LEAD ATTORNEY*

*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Larry G. Canada**

Gallaway Johnson Tompkins Burr &  
Smith

2510 14th Street

Suite 910

Gulfport, MS 39501

504-525-6802

Fax: 504-525-2456

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

| Date Filed | #                 | Docket Text  |
|------------|-------------------|--|
| 06/18/2010 | <a href="#">1</a> | MOTION to Compel Compliance with Subpoena by State Farm Fire And Casualty Company (Attachments: # <a href="#">1</a> Memorandum in Support, # <a href="#">2</a> Proposed Order, # <a href="#">3</a> Exhibit 1 - Order of 4/26/06, # <a href="#">4</a> Exhibit 2 - Order Unsealing Case, # <a href="#">5</a> Exhibit 3 - Memorandum Opinion 4/4/08, # <a href="#">6</a> Exhibit 4 - Final Evidentiary Disclosure Part 1, # <a href="#">7</a> Exhibit 4 - Final Evidentiary Disclosure Part 2, # <a href="#">8</a> Exhibit 4 Final Evidentiary Disclosure Part 3, # <a href="#">9</a> Exhibit 5 Part 1 of 20/20 Story, # <a href="#">10</a> Exhibit 5 Part 2 of 20/20 Story, # <a href="#">11</a> Exhibit 5 Part 3 of 20/20 Story, # <a href="#">12</a> Exhibit 6 Relator's Evidentiary Disclosure Part 1, # <a href="#">13</a> Exhibit 6 Relator's Evidentiary Disclosure Part 2, # <a href="#">14</a> Exhibit 6 Relator's Evidentiary Disclosure Part 3, # <a href="#">15</a> Exhibit 7 SF Disclosure Part 1, # <a href="#">16</a> Exhibit 7 SF Disclosure Part 2, # <a href="#">17</a> Exhibit 7 SF Disclosure Part 3, # <a href="#">18</a> Exhibit 8 Excerpts of Cori Rigsby Depo Vol II, # <a href="#">19</a> Exhibit 9 Associated Press Story, # <a href="#">20</a> Exhibit 10 Final Evidentiary Part 1, # <a href="#">21</a> Exhibit 10 Final Evidentiary Part 2, # <a href="#">22</a> Exhibit 10 Final Evidentiary Part 3, # <a href="#">23</a> Exhibit 11 NY Times Story, # <a href="#">24</a> Exhibit 12 First Amended Complaint Part 1, # <a href="#">25</a> Exhibit 12 First Amended Complaint Part 2, # <a href="#">26</a> Exhibit 12 First Amended Complaint Part 3, # <a href="#">27</a> Exhibit 12 Amended Complaint Part 4, # <a href="#">28</a> Exhibit 13 Congressional Record 9/21/06, # <a href="#">29</a> Exhibit 14 Statement of Gene Taylor 2/28/07, # <a href="#">30</a> Exhibit 15 Subpoena Scruggs Law Firm, # <a href="#">31</a> Exhibit 16 Subpoena Scruggs Law Firm Filed with Court 4/23/10, # <a href="#">32</a> Exhibit 17 Mallette Letter to Walker 4/23/10, # <a href="#">33</a> Exhibit 18 Walker Letter to Mallette 5/10/10, # <a href="#">34</a> Exhibit 19 Order of 5/5/10 Granting in Part Motion to Compel, # <a href="#">35</a> Exhibit 20 No Assignment Agreement, # <a href="#">36</a> Exhibit 21 Relator's Revised Supp. Responses, # <a href="#">37</a> Exhibit 22 Excerpts T. Hardison Deposition 7/18/08, # <a href="#">38</a> Exhibit 23 Excerpts of D. Lee Deposition of 7/8/08, # <a href="#">39</a> Exhibit 24 Excerpts of C. Rigsby Deposition of 11/19/07, # <a href="#">40</a> Exhibit 25 Excerpts of K. Rigsby Deposition of 11/20/07, # <a href="#">41</a> Exhibit 26 Excerpts of P. Lobrano Deposition of 4/8/10, # <a href="#">42</a> Exhibit 27 Excerpts A. Ford Deposition of 10/10/07, # <a href="#">43</a> Exhibit 28 E-mail 5/22/06 from B. Ford, # <a href="#">44</a> Exhibit 29 E-mail 8/8/06 from D. Wyatt, # <a href="#">45</a> Exhibit 30 Handwritten Notes of B. Ford, # <a href="#">46</a> Exhibit 31 Handwritten Notes B. Ford SDT 100293, # <a href="#">47</a> Exhibit 32 Privilege Log of Rendon Group, # <a href="#">48</a> Case Assignment)(SMT) Modified on 6/21/2010 to reflect receipt of \$350.00 1778668(SMT). (Entered: 06/21/2010) |
| 06/18/2010 | <a href="#">2</a> | MOTION for Emergency Hearing re <a href="#">1</a> MOTION to Compel by State Farm Fire And Casualty Company by State Farm Fire And Casualty Company (Attachments: # <a href="#">1</a> Proposed Order)(SMT) (Entered: 06/21/2010)  |
| 06/18/2010 | <a href="#">3</a> | FRCP 7.1 DISCLOSURE STATEMENT by State Farm Fire And Casualty Company. (SMT) (Entered: 06/21/2010)   |
| 06/21/2010 |                   | Conflict Check run. (SMT) (Entered: 06/21/2010)  |
| 06/21/2010 |                   | ***MOTION SUBMITTED TO CHAMBERS of Wilhoit for review: re <a href="#">1</a> MOTION to Compel by State Farm Fire And Casualty Company, <a href="#">2</a> MOTION   |

|            |                   |   |
|------------|-------------------|---|
|            |                   | for Hearing re <a href="#">1</a> MOTION to Compel by State Farm Fire And Casualty Company by State Farm Fire And Casualty Company (SMT) (Entered: 06/21/2010)   |
| 06/21/2010 | <a href="#">4</a> | ORDER REASSIGNING CASE. Case reassigned to Judge David L. Bunning for all further proceedings. Judge Henry R. Wilhoit, Jr no longer assigned to case. Signed by Judge Henry R. Wilhoit, Jr on 6/21/10.(SMT)cc: COR (Entered: 06/21/2010)  |
| 06/21/2010 |                   | Conflict Check run. (SMT) (Entered: 06/21/2010)   |
| 06/21/2010 |                   | ***FILE SUBMITTED TO CHAMBERS of Bunning for review: <a href="#">4</a> Order Reassigning Case (SMT) (Entered: 06/21/2010)   |
| 06/22/2010 | <a href="#">5</a> | ORDER, matter having been reassigned to undersigned and having reviewed record and reached conclusion that judicial economy and efficiency would be best served by referring action to U.S. Mag. Judge at Ashland to supervise discovery and other pretrial proceedings unless altered by subsequent order 1) Case referred to Magistrate Judge Edward B. Atkins the reference includes but not limited to the two recently filed motions <a href="#">1</a> MOTION to Compel and <a href="#">2</a> MOTION for Hearing 2) that in connection with such reference the Mag. Judge is authorized to conduct all pretrial and status conference to hold such hearings as may be required and to rule on nondispositive mtions pursuant to 28 USC 636(b)91). Signed by Judge David L. Bunning on 6/22/10.(SMT)cc: COR (Entered: 06/22/2010) |
| 06/22/2010 |                   | ***MOTION SUBMITTED TO CHAMBERS of Atkins for review: re <a href="#">1</a> MOTION to Compel by State Farm Fire And Casualty Company, <a href="#">2</a> MOTION for Hearing re <a href="#">1</a> MOTION to Compel by State Farm Fire And Casualty Company by State Farm Fire And Casualty Company (SMT) (Entered: 06/22/2010)   |
| 06/22/2010 | <a href="#">6</a> | MOTION for Benjamin M. Watson to Appear Pro Hac Vice by State Farm Fire And Casualty Company ( Filing fee \$65; receipt number 1780890)Motions referred to Edward B Atkins. (Attachments: # <a href="#">1</a> Unsworn Declaration of B. Watson, # <a href="#">2</a> Proposed Order)(Stopher, Edward) (Entered: 06/22/2010)  |
| 06/22/2010 |                   | Attorney Update. Attorney Benjamin M. Watson for State Farm Fire And Casualty Company added. (SMT) (Entered: 06/23/2010)  |
| 06/23/2010 |                   | BAR STATUS Check completed as to Benjamin M. Watson re <a href="#">6</a> MOTION for Benjamin M. Watson to Appear Pro Hac Vice by State Farm Fire And Casualty Company ( Filing fee \$65; receipt number 1780890) MOTION for Benjamin M. Watson to Appear Pro Hac Vice by State Farm Fire And Casualty Company ( Filing fee \$65; receipt number 1780890). (SMT) (Entered: 06/23/2010)   |
| 06/23/2010 |                   | ***MOTION SUBMITTED TO CHAMBERS of Atkins for review: re <a href="#">6</a> MOTION for Benjamin M. Watson to Appear Pro Hac Vice by State Farm Fire And Casualty Company ( Filing fee \$65; receipt number 1780890) MOTION for Benjamin M. Watson to Appear Pro Hac Vice by State Farm Fire And Casualty Company ( Filing fee \$65; receipt number 1780890) (SMT) (Entered: 06/23/2010)  |



|            |                    |   |
|------------|--------------------|---|
| 06/23/2010 | <a href="#">7</a>  | ORDER; before court on re <a href="#">1</a> MOTION to Compel by State Farm Fire And Casualty Company, <a href="#">2</a> MOTION for Hearing by State Farm Fire And Casualty Company, 1) <b>TELEPHONE CONFERENCE set for 6/24/2010 at 03:00 PM in PIKEVILLE before Magistrate Judge Edward B Atkins</b> during call counsel be prepared to the Motion to enforce compliance with subpoena and motion for emergency hearing 2) the undersigned's office shall initiate said call to the following attys at the numbers listed on the docket sheet for the Scruggs Law Firm, Cal Mayo, for dft State Farm Casualty Co, Edward Stopher 3) clerk directed to secure the services of a court reporter for telephonic conference. Signed by Magistrate Judge Edward B Atkins on 6/23/10.(SMT)cc: COR (Entered: 06/24/2010)  |
| 06/24/2010 | <a href="#">8</a>  | NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by The Scruggs Law Firm, P.A./SLF, Inc.. (Edwards, Carl) (Entered: 06/24/2010)   |
| 06/24/2010 | <a href="#">9</a>  | MOTION to Quash Subpoenas by The Scruggs Law Firm, P.A./SLF, Inc. (Edwards, Carl) Modified to add text "Subpoenas" on 6/25/2010 (KSS). (Entered: 06/24/2010)  |
| 06/24/2010 | <a href="#">10</a> | RESPONSE to Motion re <a href="#">9</a> MOTION to Quash by The Scruggs Law Firm, P.A./SLF, Inc., <a href="#">2</a> MOTION for Hearing re <a href="#">1</a> MOTION to Compel by State Farm Fire And Casualty Company by State Farm Fire And Casualty Company, <a href="#">1</a> Motion to Compel filed by The Scruggs Law Firm, P.A./SLF, Inc.. (Attachments: # <a href="#">1</a> Exhibit A - Email Walker to Mayo - 3/23/10, # <a href="#">2</a> Exhibit B - Email Exchanges Walker and Mayo, # <a href="#">3</a> Exhibit C - Email Exchanges Walker and Mayo, # <a href="#">4</a> Exhibit D - Mississippi Documents Subpoena, # <a href="#">5</a> Exhibit E - Initial Kentucky Documents Subpoena, # <a href="#">6</a> Exhibit F - Objections to Document Requests, # <a href="#">7</a> Exhibit G - Email Mayo to Walker, # <a href="#">8</a> Exhibit H - Letter Walker to Mayo 6/1/10, # <a href="#">9</a> Exhibit I - Second Kentucky Documents Subpoena, # <a href="#">10</a> Exhibit J - Corporate Information Regarding SLF, Inc.)(Edwards, Carl) Modified to create link and docket entry relationship on 6/25/2010 (KSS). (Entered: 06/24/2010) |
| 06/24/2010 | <a href="#">16</a> | MINUTE ENTRY ORDER FOR TELEPHONE CONFERENCE held on 6/24/2010.; matter called for proceedings; matter is taken under advisement; an order is forthcoming before Magistrate Judge Edward B Atkins: (Court Reporter JUNE ST JOHN.) (SMT)cc: COR (Entered: 06/28/2010)   |
| 06/25/2010 |                    | ***MOTION SUBMITTED TO CHAMBERS of Edward B. Atkins for review: re <a href="#">9</a> MOTION to Quash Subpoenas by The Scruggs Law Firm, P.A./SLF, Inc. (KSS) (Entered: 06/25/2010)  |
| 06/25/2010 | <a href="#">11</a> | RESPONSE in Opposition re <a href="#">9</a> MOTION to Quash Subpoenas by The Scruggs Law Firm, P.A./SLF, Inc. filed by State Farm Fire and Casualty Company. (Attachments: # <a href="#">1</a> Exhibit A - MS Secretary of State website printout, # <a href="#">2</a> Exhibit B - MS Secretary of State 2009 Corporate Report)(Stopher, Edward) (Entered: 06/25/2010)  |
| 06/25/2010 | <a href="#">12</a> | REPLY to Response to Motion re <a href="#">1</a> MOTION to Compel by State Farm Fire And Casualty Company, <a href="#">2</a> MOTION for Hearing re <a href="#">1</a> MOTION to Compel by State Farm Fire And Casualty Company by State Farm Fire And Casualty Company filed by State Farm Fire and Casualty Company. (Attachments: # <a href="#">1</a>  |



|            |                    |  |
|------------|--------------------|--|
|            |                    | Exhibit A - MS Secretary of State website printout, # <a href="#">2</a> Exhibit B - MS Secretary of State 2009 Corporate Report)(Stopher, Edward) (Entered: 06/25/2010)  |
| 06/25/2010 |                    | NOTICE OF DOCKET MODIFICATION and DOCUMENT CONVERSION REQUIREMENT TO Carl Edwards <a href="#">Error 1</a> ; Error: a link was not created to the Motion to Compel document. Entry by attorney; Clerk modified the entry to create link to the Motion; In the future, create a link to the related document. <a href="#">Error 2</a> re <a href="#">9</a> MOTION to Quash Subpoenas by The Scruggs Law Firm, P.A./SLF, Inc., and re <a href="#">10</a> Response to Motion Error: the pleadings were scanned instead of converted into PDF format directly from the native word application. Use a scanner ONLY if you cannot electronically prepare your documents with a word processing software package and convert them to PDF format. No further action required by counsel. cc: COR (KSS) (Entered: 06/25/2010) |
| 06/25/2010 | <a href="#">13</a> | MOTION for Pope S. Mallette to Appear Pro Hac Vice by The Scruggs Law Firm, P.A./SLF, Inc. ( Filing fee \$65; receipt number 1783965)Motions referred to Edward B Atkins. (Attachments: # <a href="#">1</a> Exhibit A - Affidavit In Support Of Motion To Admit Counsel Pro Hac Vice, # <a href="#">2</a> Exhibit B - ECF Registration Form for Pope S. Mallette)(Edwards, Carl) (Entered: 06/25/2010)   |
| 06/25/2010 | <a href="#">14</a> | MEMORANDUM in Support of Motion re <a href="#">9</a> MOTION to Quash Subpoenas by The Scruggs Law Firm, P.A./SLF, Inc. filed by The Scruggs Law Firm, P.A./SLF, Inc.. (Attachments: # <a href="#">1</a> Exhibit A - 47Letter - Walker to Mayo, # <a href="#">2</a> Exhibit B - Email Mayo to Watson, # <a href="#">3</a> Exhibit C - Email - Mayo to Walker, # <a href="#">4</a> Exhibit D - McIntosh Order 5-15-08, # <a href="#">5</a> Exhibit E - Order D. C. Magistrate Facciola)(Edwards, Carl) (Entered: 06/25/2010)   |
| 06/25/2010 | <a href="#">15</a> | ORDER: (1) Motion to compel compliance w/Subpoena <a href="#">1</a> is granted, however, the Subpoena shall be MODIFIED to the extent that production shall be made at the offices of Carl D. Edwards, Jr. (at address herein); (2) Denying as moot, the motion for emergency hearing as matter previously came before the Court for a telephone conference; (3) Granting Motions to appear pro hac vice <a href="#">6</a> and <a href="#">13</a> ; (4) Denying <a href="#">9</a> Motion to Quash subpoena. Signed by Magistrate Judge Edward B. Atkins on 6/25/2010. (CMR) cc: COR w/General Order 06-11 re: Mandatory ECF and ECF Registration Form to Attorney Benjamin M. Watson and to Attorney Pope S. Mallette (Entered: 06/25/2010)  |
| 06/28/2010 |                    | BAR STATUS Check completed as to Pope S. Mallette re <a href="#">13</a> MOTION for Pope S. Mallette to Appear Pro Hac Vice by The Scruggs Law Firm, P.A./SLF, Inc. ( Filing fee \$65; receipt number 1783965) MOTION for Pope S. Mallette to Appear Pro Hac Vice by The Scruggs Law Firm, P.A./SLF, Inc. ( Filing fee \$65; receipt number 1783965). (SMT) (Entered: 06/28/2010)   |